



West
Yorkshire
Combined
Authority

Tracy
Brabin
Mayor of
West Yorkshire

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE
CLIMATE, ENERGY AND ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE
HELD ON TUESDAY, 11 JULY 2023 AT COMMITTEE ROOM 1,
WELLINGTON HOUSE, 40-50 WELLINGTON STREET, LEEDS, LS1 2DE**

Present:

Councillor Jane Scullion (Chair)	Calderdale Council
Councillor Scott Patient	Calderdale Council
Councillor Andrew Cooper	Kirklees Council
Councillor Katie Dye	Leeds City Council
Councillor Jack Hemingway	Wakefield Council
Councillor Jenny Kent	York Council
John Clark	Private Sector Representative
Gideon Richards	Private Sector Representative
Leah Stuart	Private Sector Representative
Martyn Broadest	Advisory Representative (West Yorkshire Housing Partnership)
Jim Cardwell	Advisory Representative (Northern Powergrid)
Neil Whalley	Advisory Representative (Northern Gas Networks)
Mark Wilkinson	Advisory Representative (The Environment Agency)

In attendance:

Liz Hunter (Director)	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Noel Collings (Officer)	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Peter Glover (Officer)	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Michelle Hunter (Officer)	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Myles Larrington (Officer)	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Justin Wilson (Officer)	West Yorkshire Combined Authority

1. Apologies for absence

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor Sarah Ferriby (Bradford Council), Private Sector Representative, Richard Goodfellow, and Advisory Representatives, Gregg Dodd (Northern Gas Networks) and Jenny Longley (The Environment Agency).

Neil Whalley attended the meeting as the Advisory Representative from Northern Gas Networks in place of Greg Dodd. Mark Wilkinson attended the meeting as the Advisory Representative from The Environment Agency in

place of Jenny Longley.

2. Declaration of Disclosable Pecuniary Interests

There were no declarations of pecuniary interests at the meeting.

3. Exempt Information - Possible Exclusion of the Press and Public

There were no agenda items that required the exclusion of the public and press.

4. Minutes of the Meeting held on 21 March 2023

Members had indicated that the agenda of the meeting of the Climate, Energy and Environment Committee held on 21 March 2023 contained an inaccurate reference which described the Declaration of Pecuniary Interests as 'Disposable' not 'Disclosable'.

Members had also referred to the Monitoring Indicators Report that had contained a terminological inaccuracy as it should have referred to energy performance certificates as 'EPCs' not 'ECPs'.

The Governance Services Officer had noted these comments and the record had been corrected accordingly.

A member had also asked about the Project Approvals report in relation to the Combined Authority Assets Solar Project. During the previous meeting, officers had indicated that feedback from members was to be responded to, specifically in relation to whether Huddersfield Bus Station had been identified as one of the potential sites for solar panel installation work to take place.

The Director for Policing, Environment & Place confirmed that an email had been sent to members on 23 March confirming that Huddersfield Bus Station had been selected as a site for such works to take place.

The Chair had further noted she had been pleased to see in the Minutes that officers had been reminded of the need to correctly reference CO₂e in reports rather than CO₂ as it had been vital to emphasise the importance in maintaining a consistent approach to referencing the correct terminology.

Resolved: That the Minutes of the meeting of Climate, Energy and Environment Committee held on 21 March 2023 were approved.

As the Chair had been newly appointed and not present at the previous meeting, the Minutes had been signed by a member (Gideon Richards, Private Sector Representative) who had been present at that meeting.

5. Chair's Update

The Chair had opened the meeting by noting that it had been the first time she had chaired the committee. The Chair had indicated that she had been looking

forward to engaging with the committee given the importance of its remit and the impact this had on the region. The Chair had asked each of the members and officers to briefly introduce themselves given that the proceeding had been the first meeting of the new municipal year.

The Chair had then provided the Committee with an update on the progress of the work programme for schemes that had been identified in the Climate & Environment programme. There had been allocations of funding for the Better Homes Hub, Green Skills, and the Better Neighbourhoods programmes.

The Chair noted that had been significant due to the challenges of ensuring the pace and scale of the schemes that had needed to have funding allocated to enable these to commence. In reference to the Better Neighbourhoods scheme, the Chair had noted this had been scheduled to be launched to communities in the week beginning 17 July 2023.

In reference to Item 11, the Climate Pledge Update, the Chair had noted that some additional information on the schemes was scheduled to be presented later during the meeting.

The Chair had then referenced the fact that she, along with other members of the committee, had received written material from a lobby group requesting they undertake carbon literacy training. The Chair had noted that, while on first sight this had seemed appropriate, she had also noted the existing breadth of experience of members of the committee. The Chair had then consulted members on whether they had been minded to participate in a survey on confidence levels in specific areas which would enable officers to identify skills levels and any gaps that had needed addressing.

After some discussion, during which members had enquired if such a survey had needed to be anonymised or not, it had been agreed that a survey should take place with the results known to officers but anonymised for any wider circulation. Officers would then proceed with this and report back to the Committee at a future date.

One member had asked if financial streams could have been incorporated into this process as this then could enhance the private sector perspective. The Chair had clarified that, by financial streams, the member had been referring to the different financial streams the Combined Authority had been taking through the assurance process. The Chair had indicated that such criteria would be incorporated into the consultation with members.

Another member had also enquired about the support that would be available to elected members, especially those who had been new to the Committee. The Director for Policing, Environment & Place had confirmed that an induction meeting for new members had taken place and that it was the intention of officers to continue to engage actively with members.

The Chair then concluded her remarks by offering her thanks to the previous Chair of the Committee, Councillor Tim Swift and the previous Deputy Chair, Mark Roberts for their invaluable contributions to the work of the Committee over many years. The Chair had welcomed Councillor Jenny Kent, the new

representative from York Council to the meeting.

The Chair had further noted that Jenny Longley, the Advisory Representative from the Environment Agency, would be succeeded by Jenny Cooke from October 2023 onwards.

6. Governance Arrangements

The Committee considered a report of the Head of Legal and Governance Services which advised members of the governance arrangements that had been approved by the West Yorkshire Combined Authority (the Combined Authority) at the Annual Meeting held on 22 June 2023 in respect of the Committee.

Officers introduced the report and had explained that at the Combined Authority meeting, the following had been agreed:

- The terms of reference for the Committee.
- The quorum of the Committee is 3 voting members to include 2 Combined Authority members or Local Authority co-optees.
- The Combined Authority had appointed Councillor Jane Scullion as Chair of the Committee.
- The Deputy Chair position is ordinarily held by a LEP Board member but is currently vacant. However, a recruitment exercise had been commenced for LEP Board members following which it is anticipated one or more appointments will be made onto this Committee.
- The Combined Authority had agreed meeting dates for the Committee as follows:
 - 11 July 2023
 - 24 October 2023
 - 13 February 2024
 - 28 May 2024

Members had made the following observations:

- Members had expressed a desire to see closer working between this Committee and the other thematic committees of the Combined Authority. They had asked officers to explore how closer links between these could be implemented in practice to enable cross cutting work.
- Members had indicated they would like to see representatives from young people, such as the Youth Climate Assembly, to participate in the work of the Committee to ensure the voices of young people were included in the work that had taken place.
- Members took the view that NHS representatives had an important role that could be contributed to the Committee were they to also be invited to participate.
- Members had noted that further engagement with organisations, such as the Net Zero Forum and the Yorkshire Climate Commission, that had links to national government could prove valuable and should be developed further.

Resolved:

That the Climate, Energy and Environment Committee:

- i. Noted the contents of the report.
- ii. Noted the governance arrangements approved by the Combined Authority at the Annual Meeting held on 22 June 2023.

7. Monitoring Indicators

The Committee considered a report of the Chief Operating Officer which presented members with an update on the State of the Region monitoring indicators relating to Climate and the Environment.

Officers introduced the report and had explained that:

- The current set of indicators had been approved by members at the meeting of the Climate, Energy and Environment Committee on 27 March 2022.
- The indicators had been reported on in detail in the State of the Region 2023 report, the Combined Authority's annual stock-take of West Yorkshire's socio-economic performance.
- The core indicators that had been previously agreed by the Committee included:
 - Greenhouse gas emissions (kt CO₂e equivalent)
 - Greenhouse gas emissions (kt CO₂e equivalent) by sector
 - Greenhouse gas emissions intensity ratio
 - Building energy efficiency
 - Premises at risk of flooding
 - Households in fuel poverty
 - Access to greenspace

The follow indicators had been updated with the new data since the last meeting of the Committee in March:

- Greenhouse gas emissions (kt CO₂e equivalent)
- Greenhouse gas emissions (kt CO₂e equivalent) by sector
- Greenhouse gas emissions intensity ratio

Officers had then outlined the key messages from the report.

Members made the following observations:

- Members had asked that monitoring indicators from other thematic committees should be incorporated into next monitoring paper. Members had asked for this to include a variety of proxy indicators. Officers had indicated this feedback would be actioned accordingly.
- Members enquired if the figures took into account short term behaviour changes by individuals as a consequence of the Cost-of-Living Crisis as opposed to long term shifts due to improved home insulation,

sustainable energy generation measures and changes that had occurred in usage dynamics.

- Members noted that it had been important to factor in commercial behaviour as well. One member sighted an example of a business that had been faced with electricity costs that had increased from £17,000 to £74,000 and others had noted this was far from an exceptional case.
- Due to the fact that there had not been a typical baseline year recently after factoring in national and global circumstances, members had noted that measuring different factors quantitatively had become more challenging.
- Members had requested that a deep dive session on transport emissions take place at a future meeting, so that they would be better informed of long-term trends.
- Members had observed that the fundamental point had been the data had demonstrated that the measures taken by the Committee to date had not been sufficient enough to ensure the 2030 climate targets would be on track.

Resolved: The Committee noted the headline analysis of the indicators.

8. Local Energy

The Committee considered a report of the Director of Policing, Environment and Place and sought members feedback on two key workstreams that progress the region's understanding of how the energy system in West Yorkshire needs to change to meet the 2038 net zero target.

Officers had introduced the report and explained that the requirements of meeting the target necessitated a change in the way in which energy would be generated, supplied, and used by businesses and residents across West Yorkshire. As such, the Combined Authority had therefore:

- Progressed two workstreams; Local Area Energy Plans (LAEPs) and the Hydrogen Use Case.
- LAEPs had been identified as a key intervention for delivery within the West Yorkshire Climate and Environment Plan (CEP). These would identify the location and type of infrastructure required to meet local and national net zero targets, recognising that every place is different, including the people, housing stock and geography.
- LAEPs had consist of a two-stage process:
- **Local Energy Asset Representation (LEAR):** baseline data collection, storage and distribution assets.
- **Local Area Energy Plan (LAEP):** technical and spatial analysis of different options e.g., EV infrastructure, heat pumps, for decarbonising local energy systems.
- In depth stakeholder engagement will be carried out at both stages as this is key in ensuring robust and usable outputs will be derived from this process.
- The funding had supported the production of four LAEPs across West Yorkshire, one for each district except Calderdale, which had been progressing with its own LAEP, acting as the pilot for the process in

West Yorkshire.

- Regular updates on the development of the LAEPs would be provided to the Committee at future meeting dates.

Members made the following observations:

- Members had noted that the hydrogen use case study conclusions would likely depend on who had been involved in that piece of work in terms of external influences. Members had expressed a desire to see private sector and commercial bodies included in the process.
- Members had asked that the Combined Authority continue to act as a conduit to ensure this area of governance combined cross-working along different authorities and bodies within the region.
- Members had welcomed the fact that Northern Powergrid and Northern Gas Networks (who had been represented at the meeting) indicated their active engagement with the Local Area Energy Plan and had a willingness to continue to do so.
- Members had agreed that the spatial element of the scheme had required further proposals from officers in relation to how this should be linked to local plans, which would be brought to a future meeting of the Committee.
- Members had noted that the proposals should concentrate on framing the social benefits of such initiatives through emphasis on how they had benefited communities in a tangible way. Members had also observed that additional skills development in this area had been vital.

Resolved:

- i. The Committee noted the contents of the report.
- ii. The Committee provided officers with an indication of how they wanted to be involved in the development of the LAEP and Hydrogen Use Case Study, both as a collective and individually.
- iii. The Committee provided an indication of what success looked like for them in terms of the outcome of both the LAEP and Hydrogen Use Case Study.

9. Project Approvals

The Committee considered a report of the Director of Policing, Environment and Place which summarised proposals for the progression of and funding for projects under Investment Priority 4 (Tackling the Climate Emergency and Environmental Sustainability Investment within the West Yorkshire Investment Strategy (WYIS)), that had been considered at stages 1, 2 and 3 of the Combined Authority's assurance process.

It had been noted that the Climate, Energy and Environment Committee had been authorised as a delegated decision-making authority at the Combined Authority meeting held on 24 June 2021.

Capital Flood Risk Management Programme

Officers had introduced the report and explained that the Capital Flood Risk Management Programme had been delivered as part of the CEP – Wave 1 portfolio. The programme consists of 23 identified schemes that are intended to enhance flood protection and climate resilience for homes and businesses across part of all districts within West Yorkshire. The programme had delivered new flood protection as well as the refurbishment and improvement of existing flood protection in addition to new natural flood management measures.

The CEP Wave 1 portfolio had gained decision point 1 (strategic assessment) approval from the Combined Authority on 22 July 2022.

Officers had noted during the meeting that a reference to Keighley had been missing from the report, so they verbally corrected the record accordingly.

Members had discussed the project and made the following observations:

- Members had observed that UK statistics had indicated that over 11 million properties had fallen within flood zones. Members enquired as to how many had fallen within West Yorkshire and how they had been impacted. The Chair noted that Calderdale had been especially impacted as one of the most flooded parts of the UK due its geographical nature and that infrastructure planning and water-based solutions had helped to form crucial preventive work in this area.
- Members had questioned how much input the Environment Agency had in relation to local plans and what further measured had been undertaken in relation to nature-based solutions such as significant tree planting, mandating suds on homes and establishing strategic reservoirs. Mark Wilkinson, the Advisory Representative from the EA had responded that there was a wider Flood Risk Management Capital Programme within West Yorkshire that included 130 projects, which were being delivered by either the EA or local authority partners. These are intended to address some of the challenges faced within the region due to the impact of climate change. Members had also enquired as to what the Combined Authority had been doing to input into this process.
- Members noted that it had been vital to ensure any resources maximised the value that such schemes had brought to the region.

Resolved: The Climate, Energy and Environment Committee, subject to the conditions set by the Programme Appraisal Team, approved the following:

- i. The Committee approved the contents of the report.
- ii. The Capital Flood Risk Management Programme proceeds through decision point 2 and work commenced on the individual business cases.
- iii. Conditions were set by the Programme Appraisal Team. These were to

be discharged within 3 months of the approval.

- iv. Indicative approval was given to the Combined Authority's contribution of £10,000,000 for Phases 1 and 2a. Funding was being sought for Phase 2b and 3. The total programme value was £168,000,000.
- v. Development costs of £2,255,561 were approved in order to progress the individual project business case submissions. This took the total approved to £2,369,296.
- vi. Future approvals were made in accordance with the assurance pathway, approval route and tolerances outlined in this report.

10. Better Homes Hub

The Committee considered a report of the Director of Policing, Environment and Place which had provided members with an update on the Better Homes Hub programme. The report had also sought Committee members views on a number of discussion points.

Officers had introduced the report and explained that The Better Homes Hub (BHH) is the Combined Authority's regional programme to scale-up domestic retrofit to:

- Deliver against the Combined Authority's climate emergency commitments.
- Alleviate fuel poverty and the cost-of-living crisis for residents in the region.
- Improve the quality of housing stock and health outcomes for residents.
- Stimulate the market and secure quality green jobs.

The BHH had three overarching objectives which were to:

- Build a consensus within West Yorkshire on priorities for retrofit and energy efficiency of homes.
- Deliver retrofit projects in West Yorkshire that built on momentum, strengthened the supply chain, and created new delivery models.
- Established the BHH as a trusted entity for all residents to access advice and information on retrofit and energy efficiency of homes in West Yorkshire.

The proposed activity for the BHH had included:

- Delivering area-based demonstrator projects across different tenures and socio-economic situations, that test approaches and delivery models.
- Established a One Stop Shop to provide high quality retrofit advice and support.
- Developed the supply chain and skills infrastructure to tackle retrofit shortages.
- Mobilised sufficient resource to secure funding for delivery of retrofit

- projects.
- Developed innovative funding models to support delivery of retrofit projects.
- Developed and implemented a communications and engagement strategy that mainstreams retrofit.

The report detailed how these programmes were to be delivered.

Members made several observations as follows:

- Members had agreed that EPCs were not a good measure of performance and that a wide range of energy advice would be needed to persuade consumers to adopt energy saving measures. Members had also taken the view that some KPIs were required to measure the tangible outcomes of the programmes that were referenced.
- Members had indicated the vital importance of projects being spread across the whole West Yorkshire region and not just centred in and around Leeds.
- Members had expressed a preference to have an Advisory Panel and an Oversight Panel established to enable them to keep on track of the programmes.
- Members had emphasised the importance of ensuring value for money during the Cost-of-Living Crisis by ensuring any projects that had been chosen could be clearly demonstrated as providing this.
- Members observed that retrofitting measures had been a drop in the ocean in relation to the level of challenge that had been faced, but that the point in pursuing them had been to encourage the adoption of similar measures across the region.
- Members were disappointed that only two area indicators were listed based on a technical approach rather than a people first approach in relation to two pilot projects that were coming forward.

Resolved:

- i. The Committee noted the contents of the report.
- ii. Committee members provided views on the discussion points that were outlined in section 2.23.

11. Green Skills

The Committee considered a report of the Interim Director of Inclusive Economy, Skills and Culture which had provided members with an update on green employment and skills interventions as part of the pipeline of programmes developed for employment and skills and to support tackling the climate emergency in West Yorkshire.

Officers had introduced the report and explained that the purpose of the programme was to establish interventions that had reduced levels of digital exclusion, provide businesses with support to become more sustainable, support individuals with digital and green skills, support employers with talent

acquisition, and people of all ages with a greater understanding of employment opportunities. Evidence from this Committee and the Green Jobs Taskforce had been used to develop interventions and skills packages, including:

- A £7.5m package of employment and skills interventions had been prioritised for development, the funding consists of £6.5m of gainshare funding from Investment Priority 2 – skills and training for people and £1.5m decommitted from the existing employment and skills budget.
- A variety of additional green employment and skills interventions had been proposed and approved at the Combined Authority Annual meeting on 22 June 2023. The programs, detailed in the paper, would be developed in partnership local, internal, and external stakeholders on the design throughout summer with delivery from September 2023.
- Members of the Committee were asked to provide feedback on how to develop and deliver the skills packages that had been proposed.

Members made several observations as follows:

- Several members had mentioned that they found it challenging to take the concepts within the paper and to view them from a real-life perspective. As such, members had wished, in future, to see some real-life examples in order to visualise these in a practical way.
- Members had observed that, in order to meet the relevant targets, approximately 130,000 heat pumps would be needed to be installed within West Yorkshire every year, but only 68,000 were currently being installed within the whole UK every year. It would therefore be vital to upskill people to enable them to carry out this work.
- Members had enquired on whether it was clear what the definition of a green job was as nearly any job could be classified as such.
- The Chair had noted that, in terms of upskilling green measures, as Calderdale included the highest number of start up businesses within West Yorkshire, small businesses within that part of the region would be a good place to start in terms of informative measures.
- Members had taken the view that the level of access to skills was often too high and that needed to be examined.

Resolved:

- i. The Committee noted the contents of the report.
- ii. Committee members were asked to share their views and they commented on the outlined approach.
- iii. Committee members were asked to express their interest in further consultation on the refinement of the delivery plan for the green skills offer for business.

12. Climate Pledge Update

The Committee considered a report of the Director of Policing, Environment

and Place which had provided members with an overview of selected activity delivering against the mayoral pledge to tackle the climate emergency.

This report summarised selected activity that was presently taking place to deliver against the Combined Authority's pledge to be net zero by 2038. The report set out activity from across the eight themes on which the West Yorkshire Climate and Environment Plan (CEP) had been framed.

Officers presented the report which set out the activity to date. This had included a number of projects and programmes such as:

- The Net Zero Region Accelerator (NZRA) programme.
- The Resource Efficient Business (REBiz) programme.
- Implementation of The UK Electric Vehicle Infrastructure Strategy.
- Several projects that had been commissioned using funding from the Local Electric Vehicle Infrastructure Fund (LEVI) fund.
- The Zero Emission Bus (ZEB) Programme.
- Implementation of The West Yorkshire Transport Strategy 2040.
- The Solar Programme - This programme had formed part of the Wave 1 Actions to tackle the Climate and Environment Plan.
- The Better Neighbourhoods Programme - This had formed part of the Wave 1 Actions to tackle the Climate and Environment Plan.
- The West Yorkshire Low Emission Strategy (WYLES).

The report had indicated how these projects were being progressed. Members made several observations as follows:

- Members had asked about the Zebra Bus Initiatives and if there was a commitment to ensuring such schemes were rolled out to other districts in terms of the next tranche of bus initiatives. Officers had been asked to follow up and report back to a future meeting of the Committee.
- Members had indicated that more work needed to be done to address easy wins such as minor insulation problems i.e., gaps in doors etc where relatively minor funding and support could address such issues.
- One member had specifically referenced the work of Dr Alan Palmer who is influential in relation to electric vehicles. The member had asked officers to engage further with Dr Palmer and then report back to the Committee.
- Members had emphasised that a robust communications strategy was needed to ensure the public were fully aware of all the positive initiatives being put forward by the Committee – possibly in the form of a visual infographic. Officers had agreed to action this.
- Members had expressed an interest in having a workshop to discuss air quality initiatives and the EV strategy. Officers had indicated they would arrange this.

Resolved: The Committee noted the contents of the report.

13. Date of the Next Meeting

It was noted that the next meeting of the Climate, Energy and Environment

Committee was scheduled to be held on 24 October 2023.